Compare and Critiques:

**Level 3:**
**Goal:** Provide more practice and experience with comparing and critiquing arguments and determining kinds of evidence (relevant supporting, irrelevant, relevant contradictory)

**Teaching Strategy:** Compare and Contrast arguments

**Works Best With:** Whole group, small group, pairs

**Details:**
- Provide students with several arguments to consider for each lesson. Some of the arguments should have mostly relevant supporting evidence; others should have irrelevant or relevant-contradictory evidence embedded.
- As students read through each argument, identifying each kind of evidence, students should mark each piece of evidence as RS, I or RCE.
- Ask students to rank the arguments in order, based on how strong or convincing they feel each argument is. Make sure students discuss the reasons for their rankings based on the kinds of evidence included in each argument.
- Discuss student rankings, and reasons for these rankings, as a class. Be sure to focus on students’ rationale for why one argument is stronger than another, rather than having the class agree on a ranking, since it is conceivable that students might not agree on a particular order, and it is more important for students to have time to formulate their own ideas and hear the ideas and rationale of their peers.
- Provide students with additional opportunities to do this kind of thinking and discussion with longer and more complex arguments.

**Resources:**
**N/A**

**Why This Matters:**
Students will build capacity for this kind of critique if they continually practice this habit of mind and are encouraged to work on it as they read more and more complex texts. Over time, you should see many of your students considering all the texts you offer them with this critical eye.